SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD AND THE PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD SELECTION COMMITTEE CITY OF EL PASO

November 18, 2015

A special meeting of the Public Service Board and the Public Service Board Selection Committee was held Wednesday, November 18, 2015, at the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board Meeting Room located at 1154 Hawkins Boulevard, El Paso, Texas.

PSB SELECTION COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Mayor Oscar Leeser, Committee Chair Dr. Richard T. Schoephoerster, PSB Chair Ruth Katherine Brennand, PSB Vice-Chair Terri Garcia, PSB Secretary-Treasurer Christopher Antcliff, PSB Member Bradley Roe, PSB Member Dr. Richard Teschner, Representing District 1 Richard Castro, Representing District 3 Richard Martinez, Representing District 7 Charlie Wakeem, Representing District 8

PSB SELECTION COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT

Henry Gallardo, PSB Member Tomas Cardenas, Representing District 2 Richard Vorba, Representing District 4 Sam Shallenburger, Representing District 5 Donna AlHakeem, Representing District 6

PSB EMPLOYEES PRESENT

John E. Balliew, P.E., President & Chief Executive Officer Lupe Cuellar, General Counsel

EPWU EMPLOYEES PRESENT

Marcela Navarrete, Vice President
Matthew Behrens, Assistant General Counsel
Lisa Rosendorf, Chief Communications and Government Affairs Officer
Gretchen Byram, Computer Media Specialist
Karol Parker, Public Affairs Officer
Georgette Webber, Executive Secretary

MEDIA

None

GUESTS

None

PSB Minutes November 18, 2015 Page 2

The special meeting was called to order by Mayor Leeser at 5:39 p.m. A quorum of the Public Service Board and the Public Service Board Selection Committee, (here therefore known as the "Committee") was present.

CONSIDERED AND TOOK ACTION REGARDING PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD APPLICATIONS RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTED DEADLINE.

Ms. Lupe Cuellar, General Counsel, informed the Committee that neither the City Council resolution nor ordinance address the issue of late applications. She presented the Committee with the newspaper advertisement which informed applicants of the October 30, 3015, 5:00 p.m. deadline for submittals. The Committee members deliberated regarding the acceptance of applications received after the posted deadline.

On a motion made by Ms. Garcia, seconded by Dr. Teschner and carried with Mr. Roe and Mr. Antcliff opposing, the Committee removed all applications received after the posted deadline from the list of applications received for consideration by the Committee to fill the Communications, Public Administration or Education position on the Public Service Board.

TOOK ACTION REGARDING APPLICATIONS THAT DO NOT MEET THE RECRUITMENT CRITERIA OF HAVING EXPERTISE IN THE AREA OF COMMUNICATIONS, PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION OR EDUCATION.

Mayor Leeser opened the floor for additional comments from the Committee on the remaining candidates. After deliberation and review of the qualifications for the position, and receiving counsel from Ms. Cuellar, the Committee decided not to disqualify any of the applicants but instead, allow the Committee to move on to the voting process. Mayor Leeser opened the floor to applicants were present. The Committee heard comments from Dr. Kristina Mena.

TOOK ACTION, TO INCLUDE SELECTION OF THE TOP THREE CANDIDATES, RANKING OF THE TOP CANDIDATES AND RECOMMENDATION TO CITY COUNCIL, AND OTHER RELATED MATTERS, IN REGARDS TO THE APPLICATIONS THAT MEET THE SELECTION CRITERIA OF HAVING EXPERTISE IN THE AREA OF COMMUNICATIONS, PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION OR EDUCATION.

Ms. Georgette Webber, Executive Secretary explained the process for voting to arrive at a slate of three eligible candidate for the position. Mayor Leeser asked each Committee member to select and identify their top three candidates from the group of qualified applicants. Each of the identified candidates received 1 point each time they were selected by a Committee member. Once each committee member identified their top 3 candidates, the points were tallied for all candidates with the following results:

Larry Berg	0 points
Stefanie Block	0 points
Jose Contreras	0 points
Nicolas Dominguez	2 points
Lisa Garibay	9 points
Tyler Lyon	0 points
Mark Matthys	0 points
Kristina Mena	10 points
Edward Lilly, Jr.	0 points
Andy Saucedo	2 points
Marybeth Stevens	7 points
William Wolff	0 points

PSB Minutes November 18, 2015 Page 3

Ms. Kristina Mena, Ms. Lisa Garibay and Ms. Marybeth Stevens moved on to the second round of voting. Mayor Leeser asked each Committee member to rank the top three candidates with the highest scores in order of personal preference using the following method:

1st preference = 3 points

2nd preference = 2 points

3rd preference = 1 point

Once each Committee member ranked the top three candidates by personal preference, the points were tallied for each of the three candidates with the following results:

Lisa Garibay

18 points

Kristina Mena

27 points

Marybeth Stevens

15 points

The candidates were ordered and ranked 1st, 2nd and 3rd based on the total preference points received.

1st K

Kristina Mena

27 points

 2^{nd}

Lisa Garibay

18 points

3rd Marybeth Stevens

15 points

Mayor Leeser opened the floor for comments and discussion from the Committee. Additional comments were made by the Committee and Ms. Cuellar. Once deliberation ended, Mayor Leeser requested a motion to approve and submit the candidates to City Council for consideration and selection.

On a motion made by Mr. Antcliff, seconded by Mr. Wakeem and unanimously carried, the Committee approved the following candidates to be submitted to City Council for review and consideration, in the ranking preference noted below, for the Communications, Public Administration or Education position on the Public Service Board:

1st Kristina Mena

2nd Lisa Garibay

3rd Marybeth Stevens

<u>CONSIDERED AND APPROVED THE COMMITTEE TIMELINE FOR PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD APPOINTMENT.</u>

The proposed timeline was distributed to the Committee. The list of candidates for the vacant position would be provided to the City on November 19, 2015. Mayor Leeser directed Ms. Cuellar to send the information to the City Manager and City Clerk. On December 8, 2015, City Council will consider and make a decision whether to select a candidate for the position or reject all candidates and request the Committee to begin the selection process again. If a candidate is selected for the position, the new member will be sworn in at the PSB Meeting on January 13, 2015.

On a motion made by Ms. Garcia, seconded by Ms. Brennand and unanimously carried, the Committee approved the timeline for Public Service Board appointment.

PUBLIC COMMENT: THE PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD SELECTION COMMITTEE CHAIR WILL PERMIT PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY ITEM NOT ON THE AGENDA. THE CHAIR MAY IMPOSE REASONABLE TIME LIMITS FOR EACH SPEAKER.

There were no additional comments from the public.

PSB Minutes November 18, 2015 Page 4

ADJOURNMENT
On a motion made by Dr. Schoephoerster, seconded by Dr. Teschner and unanimously carried, the PSB Selection Committee meeting adjourned at 6:13 p.m., November 18, 2015.

ATTEST:

– Chair

PSB SELECTION COMMITTEE Wednesday, November 18, 2015

COMMUNICATIONS, PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION OR EDUCATION POSITION

TALLY OF VOTES

	LARRY BERG	STEFANIE BLOCK		NICOLAS DOMINGUEZ	LISA GARIBAY	JOSE NICOLAS LISA DAVID JEROME CONTRERAS DOMINGUEZ GARIBAY	TYLER	MARK	KRISTINA MENA	EDWARD LILLY, JR.	ANDY	MARYBETH STEVENS	WILLIAM WOLFF
MAYOR OSCAR LEESER													
DR. RICHARD SCHOEPHOERSTER					1								
KATHERINE BRENNAND													
TERRI GARCIA					·								
CHRISTOPHER ANTCLIFF					,								
HENRY GALLARDO													
BRADLEY ROE													
DR. RICHARD TESCHNER (DIST 1)													
TOM CARDENAS, JR. (DIST 2)					ĺ			ĺ					
RICHARD CASTRO (DIST 3)				1									
RICHARD VORBA (DIST 4)													
SAM SHALLENBURGER (DIST 5)													
DONNA ALHAKEEM (DIST 6)													
RICHARD MARTINEZ (DIST 7)				1									
CHARLIE WAKEEM (DIST 8)													
TOTALS	0	0	0	2	6	0	c		10		ć	-	

PSB SELECTION COMMITTEE

Wednesday, November 18, 2015 COMMUNICATIONS, PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION OR EDUCATION POSITION

RANKING PREFERENCES

1st choice - 3 points; 2nd choice - 2 points; 3rd choice - 1 point

	LARRY	STEFANIE	JOSE	JOSE NICOLAS LISA	LISA	DAVID		MARK	KRISTINA	EDWARD	ANDY	MARYBETH	WILLIAM
	DEKG	BLUCK	CONTREKES	DOMINGUEZ	CARIDAY	JEROME	LION	MALLENS	MENA	LILLY, JK.	LILLY, JK. SAUCEDO	SIEVENS	WOLFF
MAYOR OSCAR LEESER					2				3			1	
DR. RICHARD SCHOEPHOERSTER					1				2			3	
KATHERINE BRENNAND					1				2			3	
TERRI GARCIA					2				3			1	
CHRISTOPHER ANTCLIFF					2				3			1	
HENRY GALLARDO													
BRADLEY ROE					2				3			1	
DR. RICHARD TESCHNER (DIST 1)					1				3			2	
TOM CARDENAS, JR. (DIST 2)													
RICHARD CASTRO (DIST 3)					3				2			1	
RICHARD VORBA (DIST 4)													
SAM SHALLENBURGER (DIST 5)													
DONNA ALHAKEEM (DIST 6)													
RICHARD MARTINEZ (DIST 7)					2				3			1	
CHARLIE WAKEEM (DIST 8)					2				3			1	
STATOL	0	0	0	0	18	0	0	0	27	0	0	15	0

RESOLUTION

WHEREAS, a vacancy in the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board will occur on December 31, 2015 with the expiration of the term of Katherine Brennan in the communication, public administration or education position; and,

WHEREAS, the City of El Paso adopted Ordinance Number 017167 which requires that any vacancy in the membership of the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board be filled by the City Council; and,

WHEREAS, the City of El Paso by Resolution established the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board Selection Committee, to be comprised of the members of the Public Service Board and such additional members as appointed by the City Council to assist City Council in selecting eligible candidates to fill the vacancy; and,

WHEREAS, under the Resolution, the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board Selection Committee reviews résumés submitted by persons interested in filling the vacant position and submits to the City Council the names and the ranking of three eligible candidates;

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE EL PASO WATER UTILITIES PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD SELECTION COMMITTEE OF THE CITY OF EL PASO, TEXAS:

THAT, a quorum of the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board Selection Committee met on November 18, 2015 pursuant to the Texas Open Meetings Act and approved the nomination, ranking and recommendation to the City Council the following candidates to fill a vacancy on the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board:

- 1. Kristina Mena 2. Lisa Garibay 3. Marybeth Stevens

THAT, the Mayor of El Paso, who serves as the Chair of the Committee, forward the recommendation to the El Paso City Council for their consideration for filling the vacancy on the El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board.

PASSED and APPROVED this 18th day of November 2015.

El Paso Water Utilities Public Service Board Selection Committee

Mayor Oscar Leeser, Chair

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

Lupe Cuellar, General Counsel